



Warm and Cool Feedback

By Krista McKim, Montgomery County (MD) Public Schools
Secondary/ Two Periods

Introduction:

Students learn the whys and hows of giving constructive feedback, for use in many performance settings but also for writing and visual art critiques.

Learning Objectives:

- Articulate the benefits of giving and receiving peer feedback.
- Give constructive feedback to classmates.
- Respond appropriately to feedback from peers.

Guiding Questions:

- How is peer feedback useful?
- What makes feedback effective?

Common Core Standards:

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.SL.9-10.4 Present information, findings, and supporting evidence clearly, concisely, and logically such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and task.

Materials:

- Clarence Jones and Martin Luther King, Jr., Birmingham, AL, 1963. Ernst Haas/Hulton/Getty Images
(http://media.npr.org/assets/img/2013/08/27/gettyimages_71018215_custom-f4d40a2ef595d5e351dbf8e0c8b860d48bf387d2.jpg)
- Chart Paper or Whiteboard
- Class set of Warm and Cool Feedback handouts
- Historic speech selections, cut into strips (one per student)

Procedures:

- Lesson Activity One: Introduction to Feedback
 - o Students analyze a photo of Martin Luther King, Jr., and hypothesize why King wanted feedback.
- Lesson Activity Two: Feedback Examples
 - o Students look at examples of feedback and decide if it is effective feedback.

- Lesson Activity Three: Giving Feedback as a Class
 - Using the Warm and Cool Feedback handout, students work as a class to give feedback to two speeches.
- Lesson Activity Four: Giving Feedbacks in Small Groups
 - Students work in small groups to practice giving each other effective feedback.

Lesson Activity One: Introduction to Feedback

Project the photo of Clarence B. Jones and Martin Luther King, Jr., on the board. Begin by asking who is in the picture and why they are famous. Most students will focus on King, and his contribution to history. After your students have exhausted all their knowledge of King, point out man behind him who is taking notes. Ask students who he might be. Most of them won't know. Tell them that his name is Clarence B. Jones and he was the first black man to make partner at a Wall Street investment bank. Let them know that he is currently a professor at Stanford University. He also was an advisor to Martin Luther King. King would practice his speeches with several of his advisors and ask them for feedback. Ask students why King might have wanted feedback. Capture their responses to this question on the board or chart paper to refer to later in the lesson.

Lesson Activity Two: Feedback Examples

Ask students to reflect on whether or not these statements are effective feedback. You can read each one and have students give a thumbs up for good feedback or a thumbs down for bad. After each poll, ask one student to explain why it is or isn't effective feedback.

1. That was bad.
2. You did great!
3. I really liked how you used sound effects in your speech.
4. Have you thought about planting your feet?. I was distracted by your rocking back and forth.
5. I hated it!
6. You are perfect.

Pass out copies of the Warm and Cool Feedback handout. Explain to students that these sentence starters help people give effective feedback. You may want to suggest that students refer to the Podium Points handout for ideas.

Ask students to volunteer their ideas about what makes effective feedback. Capture this on the board. You might ask students to their ideas to the reasons they thought that King might want feedback. Write or type out the final list so that it is visible to all students.

Lesson Activity Three: Giving Feedback as a Class

Watch Ford's Theatre 2014 Student Delegate Aniya Rios's speech:

https://youtu.be/_FjZDW_7PRo.

Using the *Think, Pair, Share* strategy, students should write down two pieces of feedback that they would share with Aniya. During the pair session, each should evaluate whether or not the other's statements qualify as effective feedback.

Watch Ford's Theatre 2014 Student Fellow Keith Powers's speech:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kn3ayv2Yeks>. Repeat the same process.

Lesson Activity Four: Giving Feedbacks in Small Groups

Divide the class into groups of four or five. Give each student a different speech selection and a few minutes to review it. Ask each to take a turn reading their selection to their small group.

After each student reads, all group members should write down one piece of warm feedback and cool feedback for them.

Note: The effective feedback list can be revisited whenever students are giving speeches. It is a good reminder whenever you ask students to give feedback.

Assessment:

Each student should look at all the feedback they received from their small group. They should pick one piece of feedback and explain why it was or wasn't effective on the exit ticket.



Warm and Cool Feedback Exercises

Constructive Feedback for Oratory Exercises

Warm Feedback

- “I really like how you...”
- “You did a great job at...”
- “It was clear that you worked hard on...”
- “It was really interesting when you...”

Cool Feedback

- “You may want to consider...”
- “I noticed that you.... It may be more useful to...”
- “Have you thought about...”
- “It was unclear to me when you...”

After receiving feedback, the speaker should always say “Thank you.”

Then they may do any or all of the following:

- write notes on the feedback in their journals or notebooks
- verbally respond to the feedback with peers
- table the feedback (if it is not helpful or if the speaker does not agree)



Speech Selections for Warm and Cool Feedback

I am compelled and you are compelled, nevertheless, to look ahead. The peace, the freedom, and the security of 90 percent of the population of the world is being jeopardized by the remaining 10 percent who are threatening a break-down of all international order and law. Surely the 90 percent who want to live in peace under law and in accordance with moral standards that have received almost universal acceptance through the centuries can and must find some way to make their will prevail.

- "Quarantine the Aggressor" by President Franklin D. Roosevelt (1937)

I speak as a Republican. I speak as a woman. I speak as a United States Senator. I speak as an American...The exercise of these rights should not cost one single American citizen his reputation or his right to a livelihood nor should he be in danger of losing his reputation or livelihood merely because he happens to know someone who holds unpopular beliefs. Who of us doesn't? Otherwise none of us could call our souls our own. Otherwise thought control would have set in. The American people are sick and tired of being afraid to speak their minds.

- "Declaration of Conscience" by Senator Margaret Chase Smith, R-ME (1950)

And so, my fellow Americans, ask not what your country can do for you; ask what you can do for your country. My fellow citizens of the world, ask not what America will do for you, but what together we can do for the freedom of man.

- Inaugural Address of President John F. Kennedy (1961)

Let every nation know, whether it wishes us well or ill, that we shall pay any price, bear any burden, meet any hardship, support any friend, oppose any foe, to assure the survival and the success of liberty. This much we pledge — and more. So let us begin anew — remembering on both sides that civility is not a sign of weakness, and sincerity is always subject to proof. Let us never negotiate out of fear, but let us never fear to negotiate.

- Inaugural Address of President John F. Kennedy (1961)

I have the audacity to believe that peoples everywhere can have three meals a day for their bodies, education and culture for their minds, and dignity, equality and freedom for their spirits. I believe that what self-centered men have torn down, men other-centered can build up. I still believe that one day mankind will bow before the altars of God and be crowned triumphant over war and bloodshed, and nonviolent redemptive goodwill will proclaim the rule of the land.

- Nobel Prize Acceptance Speech of Martin Luther King, Jr. (1964)

There is no Negro problem. There is no Southern problem. There is no Northern problem. There is only an American problem. And we are met here tonight as Americans -- not as Democrats or Republicans; we're met here as Americans to solve that problem. This was the first nation in the history of the world to be founded with a purpose. The great phrases of that purpose still sound in every American heart, north and south: "All men are created equal." "Government by consent of the governed." "Give me liberty or give me death."

- "We Shall Overcome" by President Lyndon B. Johnson (1965)

We cannot, we must not, refuse to protect the right of every American to vote in every election that he may desire to participate in. And we ought not, and we cannot, and we must not wait another eight months before we get a bill. We have already waited 100 years and more and the time for waiting is gone. ... Their cause must be our cause too. Because it's not just negroes, but really it's all of us, who must overcome the crippling legacy of bigotry and injustice. And we shall overcome.

- "We Shall Overcome" by President Lyndon B. Johnson (1965)

We can do well in this country. We will have difficult times; we've had difficult times in the past; we will have difficult times in the future. It is not the end of violence; it is not the end of lawlessness; it is not the end of disorder. But the vast majority of white people and the vast majority of black people in this country want to live together, want to improve the quality of our life, and want justice for all human beings who abide in our land.

- On the Death of Martin Luther King, Jr., by Senator Robert F. Kennedy, D-NY (1968)

The only thing they have to look forward to is hope. And you have to give them hope. Hope for a better world, hope for a better tomorrow, hope for a better place to come to if the pressures at home are too great. Hope that all will be all right. Without hope, not only gays, but the blacks, the seniors, the handicapped, the us'es, the us'es will give up. And if you help elect to the central committee and other offices, more gay people, that gives a green light to all who feel disenfranchised, a green light to move forward. It means hope to a nation that has given up, because if a gay person makes it, the doors are open to everyone.

- Hope Speech by San Francisco Supervisor Harvey Milk (1978)

Some 800,000 under-aged children work with their families harvesting crops across America. Babies born to migrant workers suffer 25 percent higher infant mortality than the rest of the population. All my life, I have been driven by one dream, one goal, one vision: To overthrow a farm labor system in this nation which treats farm workers as if they were not important human beings.

- Address to the Commonwealth Club of California by César Chavez (1984)

The consciousness and pride that were raised by our union are alive and thriving inside millions of young Hispanics who will never work on a farm! Like the other immigrant groups, the day will come when we win the economic and political rewards which are in keeping with our numbers in society. The day will come when the politicians do the right thing by our people out of political necessity and not out of charity or idealism. That day may not come this

<p>year. That day may not come during this decade. But it will come, someday!</p> <p>- Address to the Commonwealth Club of California by labor leader César Chavez (1984)</p>
<p>The time for the healing of the wounds has come. The moment to bridge the chasms that divide us has come. The time to build is upon us. We have, at last, achieved our political emancipation. We pledge ourselves to liberate all our people from the continuing bondage of poverty, deprivation, suffering, gender and other discrimination.</p> <p>- Inaugural Speech by South African President Nelson Mandela (1994)</p>
<p>We understand it still that there is no easy road to freedom. We know it well that none of us acting alone can achieve success. We must therefore act together as a united people, for national reconciliation, for nation building, for the birth of a new world. Let there be justice for all. Let there be peace for all. Let there be work, bread, water and salt for all. Let each know that for each the body, the mind and the soul have been freed to fulfill themselves... Let freedom reign.</p> <p>- Inaugural Speech by South African President Nelson Mandela (1994)</p>
<p>The truth is that most women around the world work both inside and outside the home, usually by necessity. We need to understand that there is no one formula for how women should lead their lives. That is why we must respect the choices that each woman makes for herself and her family. Every woman deserves the chance to realize her God-given potential. We also must recognize that women will never gain full dignity until their human rights are respected and protected. Human rights are women's rights.... And women's rights are human rights, once and for all.</p> <p>- "Women's Rights Are Human Rights" by First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton (1995)</p>
<p>Women come together every day in every country. We come together in fields and in factories. In village markets and supermarkets. In living rooms and board rooms. However different we may appear, there is far more that unites us than divides us. We share a common future. And we are here to find common ground so that we may help bring new dignity and respect to women and girls all over the world -- and in so doing, bring new strength and stability to families as well.</p> <p>- "Women's Rights Are Human Rights" by First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton (1995)</p>
<p>In a way, to be indifferent to that suffering is what makes the human being inhuman. Indifference, after all, is more dangerous than anger and hatred. Anger can at times be creative. One writes a great poem, a great symphony. One does something special for the sake of humanity because one is angry at the injustice that one witnesses. But indifference is never creative. Even hatred at times may elicit a response. You fight it. You denounce it. You disarm it.</p> <p>- "The Perils of Indifference" by Elie Wiesel (1999)</p>
<p>Dear sisters and brothers, now it's time to speak up. So today, we call upon the world leaders to</p>

change their strategic policies in favour of peace and prosperity...So let us wage a global struggle against illiteracy, poverty and terrorism and let us pick up our books and pens. They are our most powerful weapon. One child, one teacher, one pen and one book can change the world.

Education is the only solution. Education First.

- Youth Take-Over at the United Nations by Malala Yousafzai (2013)

Dear Friends, on the 9th of October 2012, the Taliban shot me on the left side of my forehead. They shot my friends too. They thought that the bullets would silence us. But they failed. And then, out of that silence came, thousands of voices. The terrorists thought that they would change our aims and stop our ambitions but nothing changed in my life except this: Weakness, fear and hopelessness died. Strength, power and courage was born. I am the same Malala. My ambitions are the same. My hopes are the same. My dreams are the same.

- Youth Take-Over at the United Nations by Malala Yousafzai (2013)

For we were born of change. We broke the old aristocracies, declaring ourselves entitled not by bloodline, but endowed by our Creator with certain unalienable rights. ... We are Lewis and Clark and Sacajawea – pioneers who braved the unfamiliar, followed by a stampede of farmers and miners, entrepreneurs and hucksters. That's our spirit. We are Sojourner Truth and Fannie Lou Hamer, women who could do as much as any man and then some; and we're Susan B. Anthony, who shook the system until the law reflected that truth. That's our character.

- 50th Anniversary of Bloody Sunday by President Barack H. Obama (2015)

That's what America is. Not stock photos or airbrushed history or feeble attempts to define some of us as more American as others. We respect the past, but we don't pine for it. We don't fear the future; we grab for it. America is not some fragile thing; we are large... Because the single most powerful word in our democracy is the word "We." We The People. We Shall Overcome. Yes We Can. It is owned by no one. It belongs to everyone. Oh, what a glorious task we are given, to continually try to improve this great nation of ours.

- 50th Anniversary of Bloody Sunday by President Barack H. Obama (2015)



Name: _____

Period: _____

Warm and Cool Feedback Exit Card

Copy down one piece of feedback you received:

Was this feedback effective? Explain your answer.